Research Resources

Child Sex Trafficking Team
Office of the Texas Governor
The Texas Legislature authorized the creation of the Child Sex Trafficking Team (CSTT) in the Governor’s Office to provide a collaborative and comprehensive response to child sexual exploitation in Texas. Texas Government Code §§ 772.0062 – 772.0063. CSTT’s vision is a state where children and youth are free from sexual exploitation. Our mission is to build sustainable capacity, enhance expertise, promote policies, and create new and leverage existing collaborations to prevent child sexual exploitation, to help survivors heal and thrive, and to bring exploiters to justice.

In order to enhance expertise in our state and to meet our legislative charge to collect, analyze and distribute relevant research to agencies and nonprofit organizations, CSTT gathers existing and funds new relevant research on child sex trafficking, funds evaluations of emerging and innovative child sex trafficking programs, provides training on research and evaluation findings, and provides this document, Research Resources, on our website, gov.texas.gov/cstt. Research Resources is a curated list of relevant research articles, complete with summaries by CSTT, from the last three to five years. The articles are primarily from peer-reviewed journals and are organized by CSTT’s five overarching goals: protect, recognize, rescue, restore, and bring justice. (Some articles overlap more than one of the five areas but appear in only one section.)

CSTT will continuously update and improve this collection of research by gathering, curating, summarizing and providing the latest research in updated versions of Research Resources. Enhancing expertise in our state will empower Texas to implement research-based programs and practices that prevent child sexual exploitation, help survivors heal and thrive, and bring exploiters to justice.

Our mission is to build sustainable capacity, enhance expertise, promote policies, and create new and leverage existing collaborations to:

- **Protect** children by building their awareness of and resilience to child exploitation and by curbing demand for child sex trafficking.
- **Recognize** child sexual exploitation in all its forms by raising public awareness and implementing screening tools for victims.
- **Recover** victims with protective and empowering – not punitive – collaborative and coordinated responses spanning multiple systems.
- **Support Healing** survivors through trauma-informed and responsive services and supports they need to heal and thrive.
- **Bring Justice** for survivors by holding traffickers, buyers, and those who profit from trafficking accountable.
Commercial sexual exploitation of children: health care use and case characteristics

Author(s): Gail Hornor and Jennifer Sherfield
Publication year: 2018

Summary: “Pediatric healthcare specialists should be better trained to identify and respond to commercially sexually exploited children and youth. These professionals should also in turn educate parents on their responsibility and ability to protect their children from sexual exploitation of any kind.”

Abstract: Although commercial sexual exploitation is not limited to a particular demographic, many factors have been attributed to increasing the likelihood that a child may be exploited. Such factors include mental health issues, substance abuse, living situation, and behaviors/habits of parents. The most important risk factor is believed to be experiencing sexual abuse previously. Healthcare professionals, particularly those within pediatric care, must proactively seek to identify children who are at risk to be or already are experiencing exploitation. One of the best ways to protect children from exploitation is the adaption and utilization of positive parenting techniques that develop and strengthen the parent-child relationship. Pediatric health care providers can and should educate parents on their role in protecting their children from commercial sexual exploitation.

A supportive adult may be the difference in homeless youth not being trafficked

Author(s): Makini Chisolm-Straker, Jeremy Sze, Julia Einbond, James White, Hanni Stoklosa
Publication year: 2018

Summary: “This study shows that homeless teens with a supportive adult in their life may have lower odds of being exploited through trafficking.”

Abstract: Research was conducted using data collected from homeless youth served by Covenant House New Jersey between November 2015 and February 2017. From this sample, 9.6% of those youth had experienced trafficking at some point in their lives. Using the sample, the researchers set out to study the potential differences in factors that may prevent homeless youth from being trafficked. When the presence of a supportive adult was the only factor associated with the potential of being trafficked, the data analysis revealed that such a presence was not a statistically significant factor in reducing the odds of a homeless youth being trafficked. However, according to their multivariable model and analysis, the
Protect, continued

presence of a supportive adult in the life of a homeless youth can lower the odds of being trafficked (0.345). It is important to recognize that between these two models, the presence of a supportive adult is statistically significant when other factors are also being compared across the two groups (those who experienced trafficking and those who did not). Furthermore, the researchers acknowledge that their study is limited in its application to other populations and call for future research into the area of protective factors for homeless youth on a more generalizable scale.

**Youth Experiences Survey (YES): Exploring the Scope and Complexity of Sex Trafficking in a Sample of Youth Experiencing Homelessness**

Author(s): Jennifer S. Middelton, Maurice N. Gattis, Laura M. Frey, Dominique Roe-Sepowitz
Publication year: 2018

**Summary:** “Homeless youth are at a higher risk of sexual exploitation than their peers. This sample of homeless youth in a region covering parts of both Kentucky and Indiana further illustrates that homeless youth who have experienced sex trafficking also report higher rates of sexual abuse as a child, substance abuse, mental health concerns, self-harm practices, and other negative factors that may either be a consequence of or a contributing factor to their sexual exploitation.”

**Abstract:** A convenience survey of homeless youth seeking services from various shelters in the Kentucky and Indiana region (known as “Kentuckiana”) reported that roughly 41% of homeless youths were victims of sex trafficking. Among all homeless youth surveyed, those who were identified as victims were more likely to report previous physically dangerous behaviors, such as self-harming actions, suicide attempts, and substance abuse. It is unclear if these factors primarily contributed to the likelihood of sexual exploitation or if the behaviors developed after exploitation as a coping mechanism; this is not addressed in the research. Included in the study is a comprehensive list of various statistics associated with those surveyed, broken down into categories for easy access. The study indicates that there is an intense need for trauma-informed care approaches that serve males, females and LGBTQ youth. Along with aftercare improvements, there is also a need for stronger prevention and education services, particularly among more vulnerable populations such as homeless youth.

**From Abused and Neglected to Abused and Exploited: The Intersection of the Child Welfare System with the Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Children**

Author(s): Kate Walker, Fiza Quraishi
Publication year: 2014

**Summary:** “This case study and accompanying analysis with recommendations serves to illustrate how vulnerabilities within the child welfare system can lead to the increased risk of sexual exploitation of children within the system.”

**Abstract:** While the child welfare system has an overarching goal and purpose to protect children from neglect and abuse, vulnerabilities within the system may increase the risk of sexual exploitation among system children. Children present in the welfare system usually suffer from conditions/experiences that traffickers specifically seek out in potential targets for exploitation. These factors include but not limited to physical, emotional, and sexual abuse; feelings of isolation; lack of basic necessities such as food and shelter. It is proposed that firms within the technology sector have an opportunity to assist in
strengthening and improving the welfare system by addressing certain aspects of vulnerabilities with the use of technology. Recommendations include creating a central database that can alter welfare staff members to repeated school absences of a child, creating a 24-hour response hotline with a professional advocate or social worker on-call at all times, and creating a screening tool that asks sensitive questions through the use of Interactive Voice Response so children may feel more comfortable giving honest and complete answers. It is further recommended that technology should be utilized to creating limited use or restricted versions of applications that youth may use to communicate via social media while still remaining supervised and protected from potential traffickers online. Also suggested is using social media as a campaigning tool to recruit more foster homes/parents and using technologically based curricula to educate welfare youth on exploitation and recruiting techniques of traffickers. Technology companies can also consider developing a portal to monitor trends and developments of trafficking/exploitation techniques and a portal to catalog providers and services for various welfare-based agencies. Finally, a discrete mobile application should be developed. An application that youth could access on their phones that would provide information on various programs that can help them transition out of a life of sexual exploitation as quickly as possible.

An Exploratory Study of Child Commercial Sexual Exploitation in the Hospitality Industry in the United States

Author(s): Valentini Kalargyrou, Robert Woods
Publication year: 2015

Summary: “Participating in anti-CSEC initiatives, such as signing the ECPAT-USA’s Code of Conduct, can be both morally and financially beneficial to members of the hospitality industry.”

Abstract: The authors perform several case studies on various US-based hospitality companies that have signed The Code and agreed to participate in the eradication of commercial sexual exploitation of children in their industry. The authors conclude that despite initial skepticism that such an action would reflect negatively on a company, the participating companies have received positive feedback from stakeholders and the signing appears to have a financial/business advantage as well. Companies that take an interest in supporting vulnerable populations, appear to gain favor among potential customers. It is further noted that while these efforts are laudable, many members of the industry are not participating. Researchers hope to find a way to increase participation and effectiveness of the current trends and practices in this area.

This study examines the phenomena of child sex trafficking and commercial sexual exploitation as well as how the hospitality industry can be proactive in fighting for human rights in the context of corporate social responsibility (CSR). Seven hospitality companies have signed End Child Prostitution and Trafficking (ECPAT)-USA’s Code of Conduct for the Protection of Children from Sexual Exploitation in Travel and Tourism, also referred to as The Code. The initiative of seven hospitality companies and the purpose of The Code is to provide awareness and tools to fight against the sexual exploitation of children in the hospitality and tourism contexts. Whether and how to become involved with this movement tests hospitality companies’ approach to strategic CSR. These companies can gain a competitive advantage by creating a safe and socially sustainable environment for their guests, employees and their community, as well as a good reputation by investing in strategic and long-term positive social responsibility activities related to combating child sex trafficking and commercial sexual exploitation.

Bodies are Not Commodities: Examining A21 Curriculum's Impact on Students' Knowledge, Attitudes, and Advocacy About Anti-Human Trafficking Rights and Issues
Summary: “This study looked at the impact of A21 curriculum’s impact on students and determined that participants walked away with a better understanding of human trafficking and were more engaged with this issue at large.

Abstract: Using a sample of students from a racially diverse high school in Texas, researchers studied the impact of A21’s curriculum on students’ knowledge, attitudes, and advocacy surrounding anti-trafficking issues. Students were administered a pre- and post-assessment to gauge changes in knowledge level. A focus group was also selected to provide additional insight into attitudes and advocacy of the students following the program. According to these assessments, the researchers have concluded that A21’s curriculum increased students’ knowledge of the issue and positively influenced increased advocacy surrounding the issue among students. For future research, it is suggested that the influence of teachers’ personal attitudes towards the subject of human trafficking be evaluated as well.

**Who Buys Sex? Understanding and Disrupting Illicit Market Demand by Demand Abolition, Research Report, November 2018**

This commissioned survey of over 8000 adult men is a large sampling. From an economics model perspective, the research intentionally exchanges the supply side of the equation, (more frequently studied) with the demand side, but their scope is a decidedly narrow focus. The full report has a number of graphic representations of the data depicting the data, which are very helpful in the interpretation of the data.

The survey results reveal an identified gender bias in the research without a broader query of the demand. The biases are men only buy sex from women, and not from men or children. Additionally no query was made of women who buy sex from men, women, or children. (See page 6 for their explanations.)

Of the surveyed men, actively participating frequent buyers represent men with high incomes with an apparent perceived low risk of arrest and low likelihood of prosecution.

Several key policy and legislative action items identified as a part of the survey results for addressing the demand, which are listed in the full report. Community action for changing local laws and ordinances to regulate illicit massage businesses in conjunction with reformation of the state laws focusing on the buyers with harsher penalties are among their recommendations. (See page 5.)

**Co-occurrence of Violence-Related Risk and Protective Behaviors and Adult Support among Male Youth in Urban Neighborhoods**


Author(s): Alison J. Culyba, Elizabeth Miller, Steven M. Albert, Kaleab Z. Abebe

Publication year: 2019
**Summary:** This study investigates the relationship between patterns of violence and level of adult support within male youth in urban neighborhoods. Participants with social support reported significantly fewer risk behaviors.

**Abstract:** Male youth in lower-resource neighborhoods bear a disproportionate burden of violence involvement, but little is known about clusters of specific violence-related behaviors to inform cross-cutting interventions that address multiple forms of violence. **Objective:** To examine associations between adult support and patterns of violence and risk or protective behavior co-occurrence among male youths in urban neighborhoods. **Design, Setting and Participants:** Cross-sectional analysis of baseline and end-of-program data from a recently completed cluster-randomized sexual violence prevention trial across 20 lower resource neighborhoods. Participants were male youths, aged 13 to 19 years, enrolled at youth serving community agencies in Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania, from July 27, 2015, to June 5, 2017. Data were analyzed from July 1, 2018, to February 28, 2019. **Exposures:** Social support and natural mentoring, as defined by validated survey measures. **Main Outcomes and Measures:** Validated survey measures (youth violence, bullying, sexual and dating violence, history of exposure to violence and related adversities, substance use, school engagement, and future orientation) were assessed for detailed co-occurrence patterns using hierarchical clustering, dendrograms, and heatmaps across pre-specified domains. Wilcoxon rank sum tests and logistic regression model examined associations between adult support and violence involvement. **Results:** Among 866 participants, the mean (SD) age was 15.5 (1.6) years and 632 participants (77.5%) identified as African American. All 866 participants completed baseline surveys and 577 completed end-of-program surveys. Seven clusters of risk and protective behaviors emerged: (1) school engagement; (2) career and future aspirations; (3) substance use and bullying exposure; (4) exposure to violence and related adversities, sexual violence exposure, peer delinquency, and gang involvement; (5) sexual violence, youth violence, and bullying perpetration; (6) dating abuse perpetration; and (7) physical or sexual partner violence perpetration. The strongest association cluster occurred among sexual violence perpetration behaviors. Youth with high social support engaged in significantly fewer of the 40 pre-specified risk behaviors (high social support median [interquartile range], 8 [5-12] behaviors vs low social support median [interquartile range], 10[6-14] behaviors; mean difference, 1.64 behaviors; 95% CI, 0.63-2.64 behaviors; P=.004). High social support and natural mentoring were both inversely associated with gang involvement (social support: odds ratio [OR], 0.39; 95% CI, 0.22-0.71; and natural mentoring: OR, 0.44; 95% CI, 0.250.76) and sexual violence exposure (social support: OR, 0.39; 95% CI, 0.24-0.64; and natural mentoring: OR, 0.61; 95% CI, 0.39-0.98). **Conclusions and Relevance:** These findings suggest that co-occurrence of risk and protective behaviors differ significantly among youth with vs without adult support. Violence prevention interventions designed to leverage adult support should address broader co-occurrence patterns.

**Risk Factor Patterns in Domestic Minor Sex Trafficking Relationships**


Author(s): Mary K. Twis

Publication year: 2019

**Summary:** This study explores how various forms of domestic minor sex trafficking risk factors are related, and clarifies relationship patterns observed between victims and their traffickers. Observable
commonalities of risk does not provide a pattern to equate with victimization. Prevention efforts must identify a range of risk factors and teach professionals within the systems a means to identify and remediate those risks.

**Abstract:** Domestic minor sex trafficking (DMST) is the commercial sexual exploitation of a minor citizen or legal resident within United States borders. Officials often view DMST as a monolithic crime, rather than a problem driven by victims’ variable experiences with poverty, racism, and family dysfunction. The purpose of this study is to explore how various risk factors are associated with one another and with DMST victimization, particularly within specific subcategories of DMST, such as trafficking by a family member, stranger, friend, or romantic partner. This study utilizes the archival data from 242 sex trafficked minors. The author coded the case files for the presence of risk factors, such as race, child welfare involvement, juvenile justice involvement, poverty, and more. Then, the author employed chi square procedures to explore the association between risk factors, and between risk factors and victim-trafficker relationship type. Findings suggest that DMST victimization is not a uniform phenomenon, in which all victims share the same risks. There appears to be variations between the risk factors experienced by victims prior to entering specific relationship dynamics. Counter-trafficking advocates need to articulate these variations to the range of professionals who work within the systems that may prevent, identify, and remediate DMST.

*Evaluation of a Multi-Session Group Designed to Prevent Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Minors: The “My Life My Choice” Curriculum*


Author(s): Emily F. Rothman, Amy Farrell, Jennifer Paruk, Katherine Bright, Megan Bair-Merritt, Sarah R. Preis
Publication year: 2019

**Summary:** This study examines the long-term effect of prevention education programs for minors at-risk of commercial sexual exploitation. The study shows that prevention education has a long-term benefit for at-risk minors. For example, participants in commercial sexual exploitation (CSE) programs are less likely to become CSE victims and more likely to offer help and information to other at-risk minors months after attending the CSE prevention program.

**Abstract:** “The commercial sexual exploitation (CSE) of children is a consequential public health and criminal justice problem, but no CSE prevention programs have been evaluated. The Boston-based My Life My Choice (MLMC) program offers a multisession psychoeducation group to girls who are identified as “at-disproportionate-risk” for CSE victimization and trains other agencies throughout the U.S. to offer this curriculum. The curriculum was designed to improve knowledge about the commercial sex industry and shift-related attitudes and behaviors. The current project was a multi-year, multi-site evaluation to assess the effectiveness of the MLMC prevention group. Using a one-group longitudinal design, changes in participant
behavior and CSE knowledge were measured at baseline ($n = 354$), upon group completion ($n = 296$), and 3 months after group completion ($n = 241$). The sample was 95% female-identified, 28% Black/African American, 26% White/non-Hispanic, 25% Hispanic/Latina, and 22% other race. The mean age of participants was 15.6 years old. Approximately 28% identified as bisexual, and 10% identified as lesbian, asexual, pansexual, or other. In multivariable-adjusted models, participants reported fewer episodes of sexually explicit behavior at follow up as compared to baseline (relative risk [RR]: 0.52, 95% confidence interval [CI]: 0.37-0.72 at Follow-up 1, and 0.53, 95% CI: 0.35-0.82 at Follow-up 2). Participants were 24% less likely to report dating abuse at Follow-up 2 as compared to baseline ($p = .06$). In addition, as compared to baseline, participants were 40% more likely to have given help or information about CSE to a friend at Follow-up 2, and participants demonstrated increased knowledge and awareness about CSE and its harms over the follow-up period. Although additional evaluation using a comparison group and long-term follow up would increase confidence that observed changes are attributable to the group instead of other factors, results suggest that the MLMC curriculum may be effective in reducing the risk of CSE and improving other conditions for youth who are at-disproportionate-risk of CSE.”

**Children’s Perspectives on Human Sex Trafficking Prevention Education**


Author(s): Karla Badillo-Urquiola, Jan Edwards, Afsaneh Razi, Pamela Wisniewski
Publication year: 2020

**Summary:** This study illustrates the importance of human trafficking prevention education programs for children. The study shows that children feel empowered to act when they recognize the signs of human trafficking.

**Abstract:** “About 40.3 million people across the world are victims of human trafficking. Approximately a quarter of them are children, averaging an age of 12 years old. To disrupt the cycle of human sex trafficking, non-profit organizations (NPO) provide educational training seminars to dispel common misconceptions and identify signs of human sex trafficking. In partnership with Paving the Way Foundation (PTW), one such NPO, we present evaluations from 159 children PTW’s human sex trafficking prevention education program. We qualitatively analyzed a secondary data set of surveys to understand: 1) how this prevention education effects children’s perception of their relationships, 2) how it effects the potential risk-taking behavior of children, and 3) who do children think should receive this human sex trafficking training. This research brings attention to the importance of educating children on human sex trafficking and empowering them to act against it.”

**Deterrence of Online Child Sexual Abuse and Exploitation**


Author(s): Ethel Quayle and Nikolaos Koukopoulos
Publication year: 2019
Summary: This study argues the prevention education alone does not protect children from online sexual predators. The research shows children who access the Internet face significant risks of child sexual abuse and exploitation. Online environments of social media offer sexual predators greater access to children with very few barriers or risk. The study recommends a collaborative public health approach for digital media platforms, law enforcement, and public agencies to intervene and protect children from exploitation and abuse by designing a safer online environment for children.

Abstract: “‘Cyberspace’ has added a dimension to the ecology of the child and should be a start point for practitioners (including police) to think about digital media in the context of child sexual abuse. While there is no evidence to suggest that online abuse and exploitation is a more serious offence than crimes occurring offline, the behaviors enabled by social media may present a significant risk factor for some children. This article gives a brief overview of the phenomena and prevalence of online child sexual abuse and exploitation and the role that the Internet may play. This is considered in relation to deterrence, prevention and management of these crimes, and further develops a public health approach to online child abuse and exploitation. Finally, the article critically considers emerging evidence to support this interaction between the individual and the online environment.”

**Design-Led Social Innovation in Human Trafficking**


Author(s): Lisa E. Mercer
Publication year: 2019

Summary: This paper emphasizes the importance of designing technology platforms that centralize the communication, reporting, and data to foster and facilitate collaboration among public and private agencies tasked with combatting human trafficking. The paper discusses the online reporting application, Operation Compass, as a model framework to achieve greater efficiency and outcomes by unifying, integrating, and developing shared initiatives, action plans, and partnerships to effectively eliminate human trafficking.

Abstract: “Operation Compass is an ongoing ethnographic research study, and this paper is focused on phase two: integrating a social impact framework into the foundation of Operation Compass to develop design interventions for the complex social justice issue of human trafficking. In order to develop the parameters of a foundational framework, we need to (1) develop an understanding of the ethos of the existing social system among the service providers in the fight against human trafficking, (2) define key factors from existing frameworks that could potentially apply to Operation Compass, and (3) define necessary collaborations of formal and informal partners. Established organizations have provided a structure to the nature of wicked problems related to human trafficking, thus providing a space for Operation Compass to develop an understanding of the ethos of entities involved in the fight against human trafficking. The partnerships we have, both formal and informal, have been an integral aspect of our work and have afforded us the opportunity to expand upon the limitations of the first phase. This understanding has benefited our collaborations and partners and will be implemented into the foundational framework of Operation Compass. The ability to convey to social service agencies the value of design interventions has been a social impact process—not only because of the topic of focus but also, more importantly, due to the nature of our collaborations and partnerships.”
Commercial sexual exploitation of children: health care use and case characteristics

Author(s): Gail Hornor and Jennifer Sherfield
Publication year: 2018

Summary: “Certain factors increase likelihood of a child being commercially sexually exploited. Pediatric healthcare professionals need training to better identify these indicators among patients.”

Abstract: Although commercial sexual exploitation is not limited to a particular demographic, many factors have been attributed to increasing the likelihood that a child may be exploited. Such factors include mental health issues, substance abuse, living situation, and behaviors/habits of parents. The most important risk factor is believed to be experiencing sexual abuse previously. Healthcare professionals, particularly those within pediatric care, must proactively seek to identify children who are at risk to be or already are experiencing exploitation. One of the best ways to protect children from exploitation is the adoption and utilization of positive parenting techniques that develop and strengthen the parent-child relationship. Pediatric health care providers can and should educate parents on their role in protecting their children from commercial sexual exploitation.

Sex Trafficking in the U.S.: A Closer Look at U.S. Citizen Victims

Author(s): Polaris
Publication year: 2014

Summary: “It is important to understand that human trafficking is as much a domestic problem within the U.S. as it is an international problem in third world countries. Polaris has created a report that takes a closer look at domestic victims of sex trafficking specifically within the United States.”

Abstract: Victims of sex trafficking are found all over the United States, but often times the general public is not aware of how prevalent the problem is inside their home country. Particular factors that increase the likelihood of sexual exploitation include (but are not limited to): poverty, homelessness, previous sexual abuse, substance abuse, mental health concerns, domestic violence, runaway, involvement in Child Welfare and/or Juvenile Justice System, child abuse/neglect, and/or other types of trauma. Exploitation may be initiated by a romantic partner, a family member, an employer, or even a complete stranger. Victims often express some kind of emotional attachment to their exploiter, whether than be romantic or a belief that the exploiter is their only source of protection and/or income. Many
victims come in contact with healthcare, law enforcement, and/or child welfare professionals during the period of their exploitation. Such front-line professionals should be better trained and prepared to recognize and respond to victims of sex trafficking. The report includes additional statistics about characteristics and experiences of sex trafficking survivors. This is an excellent starting point for source material on the topic of sex trafficking.

**Exploring Internal Child Sex Trafficking Networks Using Social Network Analysis**

Author(s): Eleanor Cockbain, Helen Brayley, Gloria Laycock  
Publication year: 2011

**Summary:** “Social Network Analysis can be used as a tool to support the identification, investigation, and disruption of internal child sex trafficking within the United States.”

**Abstract:** Social Network Analysis can take information gathered from previous investigations to piece together a large picture of the networks associated with and generating internal child sex trafficking within the United States. Utilization of such information can provide valuable insights into how such networks form and operate, providing support for additional creative problem-solving and preventative measures to stop future networks from forming and disrupt current networks in operation.

**The Value of Crime Scripting: Deconstructing Internal Child Sex Trafficking**

Author(s): Helen Braley, Eleanor Cockbain, Gloria Laycock  
Publication year: 2011

**Summary:** “The article demonstrates how Crime Scripting is a viable and cost-effective tool in supporting strategic policing without requiring additional data, software, or training.” (direct quote)

**Abstract:** Crime scripting is a way of creating a visual diagram of various tracks an offender may pursue in order to commit a crime. By analyzing the various ways in which a crime may develop and occur through the offender’s various decision points, police may be able to exact appropriate pressure on key points of the process that are preventative in nature, rather than simply continuing to follow a reactive approach to law enforcement.

**Familial Sex Trafficking of Minors: Trafficking Conditions, Clinical Presentation, and System Involvement**

Author(s): Ginny Sprang, Jennifer Cole  
Publication year: 2018

**Summary:** “This research attempts to fill a gap in the literature on the phenomenon of familial sex trafficking of minors.”

**Abstract:** “It is well documented in the literature that child sex trafficking can be perpetrated by family members, though limited research has focused on describing this type of sexual exploitation. This pilot study addresses this gap by providing an analysis of familial sex trafficking considering trafficking dynamics, and rurality. Using a sample of 31 child welfare-involved children referred for behavioral
Recognize, continued

health assessment and treatment, this mixed methods study explores: (1) victim and trafficker characteristics, the trafficking situation, law enforcement classifications of trafficking, clinical profiles of victims, and system involvement of children and youth involved in familial sex trafficking; (2) gender differences in clinical outcomes in sex-trafficked children; and (3) geographical differences in severity of the victimization experience. Major findings document high rates of family members trafficking children for illicit drugs; high severity of abuse as measured with the Sexual Abuse Severity Score, with higher severity of abuse for children living in rural communities; clinical threshold level scores on the Child Behavior Checklist (CBCL), and the Trauma Symptom Checklist for Children (TSCC-A). Boys and girls had similar clinical profiles except boys had higher CBCL externalizing scores, and females had higher TSCC depression scores. Additionally, more than half of the children in this sample had attempted suicide in their lifetime. This formative study sheds light on the phenomenon of familial sex trafficking, thereby creating the context for further investigations. Implications for identification and effective responses to familial sex trafficking, with specific attention to gender and geography are discussed.”

"To the public, nothing was wrong with me": Life experiences of minors and youth in Texas at risk for commercial sexual exploitation

Author(s): Kellison, B., Torres, M. I. M., Kammer-Kerwick, M., Hairston, D., Talley, M., & Busch-Armendariz, N.
Publication Year: 2019

Summary: “This study describes child sex trafficking in three regions across Texas using empirically grounded qualitative and quantitative research methods. It is intended to expand the body and depth of knowledge that can help anti-trafficking professionals better identify individuals at risk for, or experiencing, child sex trafficking.” (Kellison, et. al., 8.)

Highlights (pages 8 and 9) No abstract provided in the document.
- 466 surveys of young people age 13 and 27 had to have experienced at least one of the following four factors prior to the age of 18:
  1. A history of emotional or sexual abuse;
  2. A history of homelessness or currently homeless;
  3. A history of running away from home;
  4. Involvement with the child welfare system or had been assigned a case worker from any agency and/or organization.
- Among at-risk participants, 25% of LGBTQ and 18% of cisgender heterosexual females were victims of sex trafficking.
- Approximately 7% of at-risk cisgender heterosexual males were victims of sex trafficking.
- After their first experience of exploitation, victims of child sex trafficking spend about 35% of their lives in circumstances of exploitation.
- About 33% of victims of sex trafficking in this study were victimized in the past year.
- Of those who have experienced sex trafficking victimization, 83% have also experienced some other form of exploitation.
- The average age of first sex trafficking victimization among study participants was about 15 years old.
- Around 73% of individuals who had experienced sex trafficking also engaged in un-coerced survival sex at some point during their lives.
- About half of individuals who experienced sex trafficking had been forced to participate in commercial sex by a romantic partner.
A Framework for the Development of Healthcare Provider Education Programs on Human Trafficking Part Three: Recommendations


Author(s): Cathy L. Miller, Makini Chisolm-Straker, Gloria Duke & Hanni Stoklosa

Publication year: 2019

Summary: This study provides expert recommendations to guide the development of survivor-informed education programs on human trafficking for healthcare providers. Recommendations include that organizations ensure training content delivered is evidence-based, trauma-informed, and survivor informed.

Abstract: Human Trafficking (HT) also known as Trafficking in Persons (TIP) is increasingly recognized as a public health problem. This increased awareness has prompted healthcare providers (HCP), healthcare organizations, non-governmental organizations (NGO), and governmental entities to develop healthcare provider education programs and curricular content. While well-intentioned, some education programs lack an evidence-based, trauma-informed, survivor informed approach. Evidence shows that survivors report experiencing mental and physical harm, from shame and humiliation, to sexual assault from HCPs when seeking care services. As organizations endeavor to provide education to HCPs on HT, organizations have a responsibility to ensure content delivered is evidence-based, trauma-informed, and survivor informed. This paper seeks to provide such recommendations and guidelines and is based on the findings of a two-round Delphi study of subject matter and survivor experts and the best available evidence (Stoklosa, Miller, Duke, & Chisolm-Straker, 2019; Chisolm-Straker, Miller, Duke, & Stoklosa, 2019).

Childhood Polyvictimization, Adult Violent Victimization, and Trauma Symptomatology: An Exploratory Study of Prostitution Diversion Program Participants


Author(s): Alexander H. Updegrove, Lisa R. Muftic

Publication year: 2018

Summary: This study suggests that participants in prostitution diversion programs may have a more difficult time successfully completing the program if they have experienced multiple traumas as children.

Abstract: Prostitution diversion program participants who have experienced lifelong patterns of abuse, including child polyvictimization and later adult victimization, may exhibit greater trauma symptomatology than participants who have not experienced lifelong abuse. If true, these participants may face unique barriers to successful program completion as a result of their increased trauma symptomatology. This calls into question whether incarceration is an appropriate sanction for program failure. Data from a prostitution diversion program located in Houston, Texas, was used to conduct a series of bivariate analyses that examined whether participants who had experienced multiple types of
Recognize, continued

child abuse: (1) were more criminally involved, (2) were more likely to report adult victimization, and (3) exhibited greater trauma symptomatology relative to program participants who had never experienced child abuse, or only experienced a single type. Participants who had experienced multiple types of child abuse were more likely to report adult victimization and greater trauma symptomatology relative to participants who had not experienced any child abuse. The prostitution diversion program examined in this study contained a subgroup of participants who had experienced multiple types of child abuse, possessed an increased risk of adult victimization, and reported greater trauma symptomatology. These participants are trauma survivors, and may face unique barriers to program completion. Consequently, incarceration is a misguided sanction for program failure, as it may lead to further traumatization.

**Human Trafficking Victim Identification, Assessment, and Intervention Strategies in South Texas Emergency Departments**


Author(s): Jean Dowling Dols, Diana Beckmann-Mendez, Jessica McDow, Katherine Walker, Michael Moon

Publication year: 2019

**Summary:** This study of 99 emergency medical departments in South Texas showed a widespread failure to recognize human trafficking victims due to lack of awareness of the human trafficking (HT) experience, need for clinical education related to evidence-based protocols, and the need for validated screening instruments and standardization of processes that promote action and provide victim assistance.

**Abstract:** Human-trafficking victims seek assistance for health issues in emergency departments. This point of contact provides an opportunity for screening and identification of the victim’s situation, enabling intervention. This descriptive research study was designed to identify whether a standard protocol is currently used to identify, assess, and intervene for human-trafficking victims in 47 south Texas counties. ED leaders were surveyed using a sequential set of strategies including online, e-mail, and/or phone surveys to identify the methods used in emergency departments screening for adult/child human-trafficking victims. Researchers surveyed 99 emergency departments in south Texas, which includes 21 counties bordering Mexico. Twenty-seven ED leaders responded (27.3%). Despite being located in an area with high rates of human trafficking, these leaders stated that few trafficking victims were identified in 2017. Eleven (40.7%) of the responding emergency departments specifically screened adults for human trafficking, and 10 (37.0%) specifically screened children for human trafficking. A variety of methods were used by each of these emergency departments to identify human-trafficking victims. The failure to recognize human-trafficking victims prevents assessment of the victim’s status and further delays referral to appropriate resources. Barriers to screening for human trafficking included lack of awareness of the human-trafficking experience, need for clinical education related to evidence-based protocols, and need for validated screening instruments and standardization of processes that promote action and provide victim assistance.
**Human Trafficking Education for Pre-Licensure Nursing Students: A Quality Improvement Project**


Author(s): Mollie Elizabeth Flowers

Publication year: 2019

**Summary:** This study showed that a concise 20-minute online education module for nurses can increase knowledge level and self-perceived ability to identify and help human trafficking victims.

**Abstract:** Human trafficking is a form of modern slavery and a violation of human rights (Scanwell, Macdonald, Berger, & Boyer, 2018). An estimated 40.3 million individuals are being trafficked globally at any one time with 14,500 to 17,500 being trafficked within the United States annually (Polaris, 2018; Mason et al., 2016; Richards, 2014). An estimated 87% of human trafficking victims were seen by healthcare professionals during the time they were being trafficked and went unrecognized. (Lederer & Wetzel, 2014). This project utilized the Plan–Do–Check–Act model for quality improvement. (Agency for Healthcare Research and Quality, n.d.). This project consisted of a 20-minute online education module for pre-licensure nursing students (undergraduate and Master’s Entry to Professional Nursing [MEPN]) with a self-created, mock video simulation with pre- and post-test measures. Scored pre- and post-tests were analyzed through SPSS and a paired t-test completed. Pre-test mean for undergraduate participants was 58.38 (N= 15). Post-test mean score was 78.71 (N= 13). Pre-test mean for MEPN was 59.13 (N= 25), the post-test mean was 81.2 (N = 22) There is strong evidence (undergraduate: (t = 3.92, p = 0.002), MEPN: (t = 5.303, p = 0.000) the education module increased knowledge level based on scored pre- and post-tests. Based on the reported statistics, the use of educational sessions and training can statistically increase knowledge level and self-perceived ability to identify and refer victims appropriately in this population.

**Human Trafficking of Children: Nurse Practitioner Knowledge, Beliefs, and Experience Supporting the Development of a Practice Guideline: Part One**


Author(s): Jessica L. Peck, Mikki Meadows-Oliver

Publication year: 2019

**Summary:** There is a need for quality education and clinical practice guidelines for pediatric clinicians to identify potential and actual human trafficking victims.

**Abstract:** Up to 87% of trafficking victims encounter a health care provider while being trafficked but are not recognized as victims. Most health care providers receive little or no training, and awareness remains low. To describe the knowledge, beliefs, and attitudes of pediatric advanced practice registered nurses about human trafficking. A survey of the National Association of Pediatric Nurse Practitioners membership (n = 8,647) before the intervention measured knowledge, beliefs, and experience regarding child trafficking. An awareness campaign was implemented with continuing education, national media...
Recognize, continued

presence, Train the Trainer programs, and creation of a nonprofit organization to direct strategic initiatives. Overall, 799 (9%) NAPNAP members completed the survey. Although 87% believed it possible that they might encounter a victim of trafficking in their practice, 35% were unsure if they had provided care for a victim. Only 24% reported confidence in their ability to identify a child at risk for trafficking. These survey findings indicate the need for clinical practice guidelines to identify potential and actual victims of human trafficking. Pediatric advanced practice registered nurses are ideally equipped and situated to intervene on behalf of vulnerable children with health disparities in a myriad of care settings, advocating for prevention and optimization of equitable health outcomes.

**Using Survivors’ Voices to Guide the Identification and Care of Trafficked Persons by U.S. Health Care Professionals**


Author(s): Stephanie Armstrong, V. Jordan Greenbaum

Publication year: 2019

**Summary:** This literature review provides insight into the barriers human trafficking victims face in accessing medical and mental health services and recommends a trauma-informed, rights-based approach to care to address them.

**Abstract:** Evidence suggests that trafficked persons in the United States frequently seek healthcare, yet little is known of their experiences, including reasons for seeking assistance, interactions with professionals, and barriers to obtaining care. To gain a better understanding, a search was conducted for empirical data collected directly from trafficked persons about their US health care experiences, published in peer-reviewed journals within the past 10 years, and in the English language. Four data bases were searched and of the 1,605 articles initially identified, 8 met all inclusion criteria. Data from 420 participants demonstrated a wide range of physical and mental health complaints and 50%–98% reported seeking health care services in diverse medical settings during their exploitation. Barriers to care occurred at various levels, and although some are not modifiable, others are amendable by changes in the behaviors of professionals. A trauma-informed, rights-based approach to care would address many of these issues and create feasible treatment plans.

**Youth Arrested for Trading Sex Have the Highest Rates of Childhood Adversity: A Statewide Study of Juvenile Offenders**


Youth arrested for trading sex in Florida had higher rates of adverse childhood experiences (ACES), particularly for sexual abuse and neglect, than youth arrested for other crimes.

Abstract: A history of childhood adversity is associated with high-risk behaviors and criminal activity in both adolescents and adults. Furthermore, individuals with histories of child maltreatment are at higher risk for engaging in risky sexual behavior, experiencing re-victimization, and in some cases, becoming sexual offenders. The purpose of the current study was to examine the prevalence of individual and cumulative adverse childhood experiences (ACEs) reported by 102 offending youth who were arrested for trading sex and 64,227 offending youth who were arrested for various other crimes, using Florida’s Positive Achievement Change Tool. Youth with violations related to sex trafficking had higher rates for each ACE as well as number of ACEs, particularly sexual abuse and physical neglect. These findings have implications for identifying adverse experiences in both maltreated and offending youth as well as tailoring services to prevent re-victimization.

Modern Slavery and Public Health: A Rapid Evidence Assessment and an Emergent Public Health Approach


Author(s): Such, E., Laurent, C., Jaipaul, R., and Salway, S.
Publication year: 2020

Summary: This study addresses the need for a public health approach to issue of modern slavery. The study finds public health officials and professionals at all levels of the public and private sector must engage and intervene on behalf of victims of human trafficking. Developing a comprehensive public health approach is necessary to provide the level of support services and multi-level treatment facilities needed for survivors to recover from the physical and mental health trauma they suffered while in exploitation.

Abstract: “Objective: Modern slavery is a human rights violation and a global health concern. To date, criminal justice approaches have dominated attempts to address it. Modern slavery has severe consequences for people’s mental and physical health, and there is a pressing need to identify and implement effective preventative measures. As such, a public health approach to modern slavery requires elucidation. The objective of this study were to explore the case for public health involvement in addressing modern slavery and the components of a public health approach and to develop a globally relevant framework for public health action. Study design: A Rapid Evidence Assessment. Methods: This study is a rapid systematic review of published literature and stakeholder consultation. Results: The accounts of 32 consultees and evidence from 17 papers including reviews, commentaries, and primary studies were included in the evidence assessment. A strong ethical rationale for public health engagement in addressing modern slavery was evident. Multilevel and multicomponent interventional strategies were identified across global, national, regional, local and service levels. Although public health could add value to existing approaches, multiple barriers and tensions exist. Conclusion: Published literature and
Recognize, continued

stakeholder opinion indicate an emergent public health approach to modern slavery. It involves intervention at multiple levels and is guided by a rights-based, survivor-centered and trauma-informed approach. This synthesis offers an important early step in the construction of a globally relevant public health approach to modern slavery.”

**Labor Trafficking Victimization: Repeat Victimization and Polyvictimization**


Author(s): Ieke De Vries and Amy Farrell
Publication year: 2018

**Summary:** This research study shows there is a significant risk that labor-trafficked persons who experienced some form of prior victimization are more likely to be repeatedly victimized throughout the trafficking process. For example, the risk of sexual exploitation and abuse is higher among children and adolescents who experienced similar forms of prior victimization, i.e., sexual, physical, emotional abuse. The study recommends early intervention and comprehensive assistance programs that provide the necessary support and treatment for survivors of polyvictimization.

**Abstract:** “**Objective:** To examine labor trafficking victimizations as forms of repeat victimization and polyvictimization. **Method:** The study uses secondary cross-sectional data about 115 labor-trafficked persons in the United States who received services after the labor trafficking experience. Through multivariate regression analyses, victimization patterns were investigated at each primary stage of the trafficking process (recruitment, transportation, employment). **Results:** Our findings demonstrate patterns of repeat victimization and polyvictimization among labor-trafficked persons. Prior victimization experiences before the onset of the trafficking significantly increased the odds of experiencing victimization during the initial stages of the trafficking process (recruitment and transportation). Victimization experiences during these initial stages further increased the risk of experiencing a higher count of polyvictimization during the final stage of the trafficking process (employment). **Conclusions:** Our study lays the groundwork for an analytical framework upon which to evaluate labor trafficking. The results call for early intervention and comprehensive assistance programs that take into account enduring and cumulative victimization patterns in order to meet the needs of identified labor-trafficked persons.”

**What are the Human Trafficking Policies of Professional Medical Organizations?**

doi:10.1080/23322705/2019.1698895

Author(s): Shelley Fang, Phuong Nguyen, John Coverdale, and Mollie Gordon
Publication year: 2019

---

Office of the Texas Governor
Child Sex Trafficking Team

June 2020
Summary: This study encourages national medical member organizations to assess, enhance, and standardize the treatment protocols for trafficked victims by adopting policies focused on the treatment and recovery of human trafficking survivors. The study recommends national medical organizations direct healthcare professional across all areas of general, specialized, and emergency care to standardize the intake, treatment, and support services for human trafficking survivors. Moreover, implementing uniform policy standards at the institutional level increases public awareness that human trafficking is a public health issue that its members are prepared to face.

Abstract: “Introduction: Human trafficking is an international public health concern in which healthcare professionals are in a unique position to intervene. It is unclear how professional medical organizations have responded to the need to identify and assist trafficked patients.

Methods: Using key phrases “human trafficking,” “medical organization,” and “policy,” search engines and databases including Google Scholar, PubMed, and Google were utilized to identify medical organizations that had policies regarding human trafficking. The HEAL (Health, Education, Advocacy and Linkage) Trafficking website was also cross-referenced to identify additional medical organizations.

Results: Overall, eight out of 265 national medical organizations had policies regarding human trafficking. These were the American Medical Association, American Medical Women’s Association, American Academy of Family Physicians, Christian Medical and Dental Association, American Academy of Pediatrics, American College of Emergency Physicians, American College of Obstetrics and Gynecology, and American Psychiatric Association. Policy statements varied in their content, recommendations, and victim populations addressed. Conclusions: Opportunities exist for national medical organizations to develop their policy statements on human trafficking. While medical organizations’ policies do not ensure compliance or meaningful impacts of changes in practice behaviors, they can bring attention to this public health concern and encourage training and higher standards of care.”

Facilitators and Barriers of Drop-In Center Use Among Homeless Youth

doi:10.1016/j.jadohealth.2016.03.035

Author(s): Eric R. Pedersen, Joan S. Tucker, and Stephanie A. Kovalchik,
Publication year: 2016

Summary: This study finds the organizational structure, “come as you are” approach of homeless youth drop-in centers presents unique opportunities for facilitators to deliver higher level professional services and medical treatment to homeless youth. The research identifies key barriers and facilitators at drop-in centers in order to establish critical services like HIV-testing, mental healthcare, and substance abuse treatment, that homeless youth would not seek out elsewhere. Drop-in centers offer greater access to protect one of the most victimized populations for human trafficking.

Abstract: “Drop-in centers for homeless youth address basic needs for food, hygiene, and clothing, but can also provide critical services that address youth’s “higher-level” needs (e.g., substance use treatment, mental health care, HIV-related programs). Unlike other services that have restrictive rules, drop-in centers typically try to break down barriers and take a “come as you are” approach to engaging youth in services. Given their popularity, drop-in centers represent a promising location to deliver higher level
services to youth that may not seek services elsewhere. A better understanding of the individual-level factors (e.g., characteristics of homeless youth) and agency level factors (e.g., characteristics of staff and environment) that facilitate and impede youth engagement in drop-in centers will help inform research and outreach efforts designed to engage these at-risk youth in services. Thus, the goal of this review was to develop a preliminary conceptual model of drop-in center use by homeless youth. Towards this goal, we reviewed 20 available peer-reviewed papers and reports on the facilitators and barriers of drop-in center usage and consulted broader models of service utilization from both youth and adult studies to inform model development.”

**Understanding Health Care Access Disparities Among Human Trafficking Survivors: Profiles of Health Care Experiences, Access, and Engagement**


Author(s): Kathleen Price, Brett D. Nelson, Wendy L. Macias-Konstantopoulos
Publication year: 2019

**Summary:** This study evaluates the relationship between trafficking survivors and medical providers. The research finds survivors avoid medical and support services, withhold information, and distrust law enforcement, and health care professionals due to trauma-related fears, cultural factors, and socioeconomic factors. Trauma-induced fears and sociocultural barriers adversely affect their judgment and reasoning which influence if and how a survivor will engage the survivor services. The study recommends trauma-responsive countermeasures to address the physical, psychological, and emotional trauma-related factors with culturally sensitive, survivor-centered practices to improve health care access and engagement.

**Abstract:** “Human trafficking is associated with a profound burden of physical and psychological trauma. Survivors of trafficking interact with the health care system during and after their experiences of trafficking. Socioeconomic isolation, stigma, shame, guilt, fear of judgment, fear of retribution by traffickers, fear of law enforcement authorities, and other factors known to inhibit disclosure can exert a formative influence on survivors’ health care experiences, health care access, and health services engagement. Using a mixed qualitative-quantitative social science research method, known as by-person factor analysis (or Q-methodology), the current analysis systematically examines the scope of trafficking survivors’ health care experiences and perceptions of medical care, health care access behaviors, and degree of engagement with health services. Among 33 survivors of human trafficking surveyed, 21 met inclusion criteria for this analysis. Three distinct profiles of survivor health care experiences and health services engagement—Avoidant, Distrustful, and Constrained—are identified from the aggregate of survivors’ perceptions of medical care. Although there are salient differences across the three survivor profiles, a feeling of disenfranchisement is a common thread and directly related to health care access behaviors and health services engagement. Understanding that the feeling of disenfranchisement functions as a filter through which trafficking survivors perceive and experience medical care can help health care professionals take appropriate countermeasures. Implications for improving health care access and engagement include the implementation of trauma-responsive, culturally sensitive, and survivor-centered care practices.”
**The Role of Technology in Domestic Minor Sex Trafficking Thorn Survivor Insights Study**

Author(s): Bouche, Vanessa for the THORN (wearethorn.org)
Publication year: 2018

**Summary:** This study evaluates the role of technology in the recruitment and exploitation of domestic-born minors. The study finds the age in which a minor enters the trafficking process significantly determines the role of technology in the recruitment and exploitation of domestic-born minors. The study recommends further research into their findings is needed to understand the role of technology in domestic human trafficking of minors.

**Abstract:** “This survey interviewed 260 survivors of domestic minor sex trafficking from 14 states. 98% identified as female, 2% as male, and 1% as other. Respondents had a range of trafficking experiences including: familial, non-familial, or no trafficker. Those who entered the life before the age of 10, were almost exclusively trafficked by family members, often a father or step-father. Those who entered the life after 11 were mostly likely to be trafficked by strangers. The survey confirmed that many DMST victims experience some type of childhood abuse and neglect. 2 out of 3 participants had experiences with either foster care or juvenile detention. 41% of respondents reported that they had been in foster care. 19% of participants reported not having a trafficker, however it is likely that a trafficker did exist, but many do not characterize themselves as victims and may romanticize their relationship with the trafficker. Less than 25% of respondents have seen their trafficker prosecuted. In order to determine the role technology plays in trafficking, it is necessary to conduct much of the analysis based on the year in which participants entered the life.”

**Understanding the Mental Health Impact of Human Trafficking**


Author(s): Susan Stevens, Shekitta Acker, Kristina Green, Sheila Swales, Holly M. Fulmer, Rachel Fortinsky, and Patrice K. Nicholas
Publication year: 2014

**Summary:** This study evaluates the effect trauma has on the mental health of trafficking survivors, their treatment, and recovery. The study finds trafficked survivors may not understand or share their victimization to mental health providers even when they exhibit key diagnostic indicators of exploitation and abuse due to the complexity of human trafficking-related trauma.
Recognize, continued, and Recover

The study recommends trauma-informed approaches in working with victims of trafficking are crucial to understanding the physical and psychological consequences of complex traumas to identify and help victims.

**Abstract:** “The purpose of this report was to review the mental health consequences related to human trafficking and the important role of health care providers, particularly advanced practice nurses, nurse practitioners (NPs), and psychiatric mental health NPs in identifying and responding to trafficking victims. The framework was based on a biopsychosocial model for assessment and a trauma-informed approach to care. An integrative review of the literature was conducted to offer a comprehensive overview of the mental health consequences. Deleterious mental health consequences are common in individuals who have experienced trafficking, and symptoms suffered by individuals were assessed using the Diagnostic and Statistical Manual of Mental Disorders, Fifth Edition, criteria for posttraumatic stress disorder, as well as additional guidelines specific to a trauma-informed approach. Mental health sequelae experienced by trafficking survivors must be understood using a comprehensive trauma-informed framework for assessment and treatment.”

---

**Commerically sexually exploited youths' health care experiences, barriers, and recommendations: A qualitative analysis**

Author(s): Roya Ijadi-Maghsoodi, Eraka Bath, Mekeila Cook, Lauren Textor, Elizabeth Barnert
Publication year: 2018

**Summary:** “Commercially sexually exploited youth face barriers to healthcare access based on their perceptions of healthcare professionals being judgmental and critical. These youth also desire more access to peer-mentors who have experienced the “life” that they know in order to facilitate more meaningful progress in recovery.”

**Abstract:** Healthcare needs and accessibility are a major concern among commercially sexually exploited (CSE) youth and those that work with them. Recently, researchers have focused on trying to better understand these needs and potential barriers to access by speaking directly with CSE youth about their experiences. According to the research presented by Roya Ijadi-Maghsoodi, Eraka Bath, Mekeila Cook, Lauren Textor, and Elizabeth Barnert (2018), CSE youth interact with healthcare systems and services
frequently, particularly within the realm of reproductive health. Accessibility to these services are not limited by the availability of such clinics, but rather are limited due to CSE youths’ perceptions of the treatment and services rendered. It was identified that the main barriers to access, specifically to reproductive and mental healthcare, include the expectation that healthcare professionals may be judgmental of CSE youth, the service may be of low-quality, personal information may not remain confidential, and CSE youth may be turned in to local authorities if their lifestyle is discovered or suspected. In order to overcome these barriers, the interviewed CSE youth made several recommendations. Recommendations included increasing the usage of peer-mentors, updating and increasing reproductive healthcare education among youth at younger ages, training healthcare professionals to maintain a non-judgmental and non-paternal approach to care of CSE youth, and posting billboards and ads with healthcare contact information in areas frequented by CSE youth.

**Behavioral Health Treatment “Buy-in” Among Adolescent Females with Histories of Commercial Sexual Exploitation**


Author(s): Elizabeth Barnert, Mikaela Kelly, Sarah Godoy, Laura S. Abrams, Eraka Bath

Publication year: 2019

**Summary:** This study of 21 female victims of commercial sexual exploitation showed that trauma-informed, behavioral healthcare centered on patient-provider trust and shared-decision making increased their willingness to engage in treatment. These results inform successful delivery of behavioral healthcare for other at-risk youth populations.

**Abstract:** Adolescent females with histories of commercial sexual exploitation (CSE) have high mental health and substance use treatment needs, yet little is known about their perspectives regarding behavioral health and behavioral health treatment. We sought to understand the attitudes of adolescent females with histories of CSE regarding behavioral health to identify factors influencing “buy-in” to behavioral healthcare. Participants and setting: Participants included 21 adolescent females, affiliated with our partner organizations (two group homes, a service agency, and a juvenile specialty court), who reported having exchanged sex for something of value. In-depth qualitative interviews explored participants’ perspectives towards behavioral health. We conducted thematic analysis to identify themes concerning behavioral health. Participants provided insightful definitions of “mental health” that included positive and negative aspects of emotional and cognitive states (e.g. “being happy with yourself” and “not thinking suicidal”), indicating intensified mental health challenges and resilience. Substance use was viewed as a coping mechanism for childhood trauma and their exploitation. Trusted relationships with providers and navigable health systems that encourage autonomy were key to promoting “buy-in” and thus engagement in behavioral health treatment. A conceptual model emerged illustrating factors leading to treatment engagement. Adolescent females with histories of CSE constitute a vulnerable population with high levels of trauma as well as unmet mental health and addiction treatment needs. The delivery of trauma-focused, behavioral healthcare centered on patient-provider trust and shared-decision making that encourages client autonomy should be prioritized.
Human Trafficking Victim’s Service Needs and Outcomes: An Analysis of Clinical Law Data


Author(s): Michelle Munro-Kramer, Dana Beck, Kristen Choi, Rebecca Singer, Annemarie Gebhard & Bridgette Carr

Publication year: 2019

Summary: Analysis of files of human trafficking (HT) victims who received legal aid at the University of Michigan HT Law Clinic shed light on the extensive healthcare, social service, and legal needs of HT victims and the barriers to meeting those needs, including lack of collaboration between disciplines.

Abstract: Human trafficking is a human rights violation occurring around the world. Despite the profound social, health, and economic consequences of this crime, there is a lack of research about the prevalence and needs of human trafficking victims. The purpose of this study is to describe the healthcare, social service, and legal needs of human trafficking victims seeking services at the University of Michigan Human Trafficking Clinic. A secondary analysis of the University of Michigan Human Trafficking Clinic closed case files from 2009-2016 was performed. Data were extracted from the legal files to create a database and data analyses were completed using descriptive frequencies, logistic, and linear regression. Data were extracted from 65 closed cases made up of 49 female victims (75.4%) and 16 male victims (24.6%) between the ages of 13 and 68 years old (M=30.15). Victims had experienced labor (56.9%) and sex (47.7%) trafficking. Logistic regression modeling indicated that trafficking experiences significantly influenced post-trafficking mental healthcare, social service, and legal needs. Victims of human trafficking have extensive needs; however, there are many barriers to seeking and receiving comprehensive services. In order to serve this vulnerable population, collaboration between disciplines must occur.

Mental Health of Human Trafficking: A Systematic Review


Author(s): Awaliyah M. Suwetty, Asti Melani Astari, Titin Andri Wihastuti

Publication year: 2019

Summary: This review of peer-reviewed journal articles showed that human trafficking (HT) greatly affects the mental health of its victims and is associated with depression, isolation, disorientation, aggression, suicidal ideation, attention deficit, psychotic disorders, behavioral and post-traumatic stress disorder (PTSD).

Abstract: Human trafficking is being global crime worldwide. The practice of human trafficking in the form of human exploitation implicated in human rights violations. Survivors of human trafficking will experience health problems both physical and mental problems. The purpose of this systematic review was to identify and summarize the mental health problems of human trafficking victims. Systematic
search conducted on March 12, 2019 in data of ProQuest, SpringerLink, and Scopus by keyword "human health of human trafficking" between the years of 2013-2018. The result of this search found 14 journals that match with inclusion criteria. The inclusion criteria were peer-reviewed journal articles, written in English, all forms of exploitation, the samples are aged >15 years old. The results shown the incidence of human trafficking greatly affected the mental health of victim. Victims experienced anxiety, depression, isolation, disorientation, aggression, suicidal ideation, attention deficit, psychotic disorders, behavioral and post-traumatic stress disorder (PTSD). For further research is required in efforts to overcome the mental health impact of human trafficking victims. The focus on preventing efforts was through government campaigns, IOM and law enforcement and also the fulfillment of the rights of human trafficking victims.

**Resiliency and Women Exiting Sex Trade Industry Work**


Author(s): Kristine E. Hickle

Publication year: 2017

**Summary:** This study of 19 adults who had successfully exited the sex trade – the majority of whom had been trafficked – showed that survivors developed resiliency through the exiting process from 1) connection (subthemes include survivors, children, and spirituality); 2) resources (subthemes include networks, structure and safety); and 3) personal growth.

**Abstract:** A qualitative approach was used to explore the experience of exiting sex trade industry work from the perspective of 19 adults formerly involved in the sex trade industry. A narrative approach to data collection was used to explore the participants’ experiences of successful exiting and phenomenological analysis was employed to identify themes that reflected the ways in which participants developed resiliency throughout the exiting process. Themes include connection (including subthemes: survivor presence, children and spirituality), resources (including subthemes: networks, structure and safety) and personal growth. These themes represent women with diverse experiences in the sex trade industry, including a majority who were victimized by [domestic] sex trafficking. The findings demonstrate opportunities for social work practice to address the diverse needs of individuals exiting the sex trade industry, specifically for those who experienced sex trafficking and sexual exploitation.

**Comprehensive Care Model for Sex Trafficking Survivors**


Author(s): Naomi M. Twigg

Publication year: 2016
Summary: This study of 5 U.S. residential treatment centers for youth victims provides a deeper understanding of the range of services currently provided and suggests that these be expanded to include education re-entry, family reunification, family reconciliation, and emergency substance abuse services.

Abstract: The purpose of this study was to identify aftercare services for domestic minor of sex trafficking (DMST) survivors provided by U.S. residential treatment centers. Design: A qualitative research study was conducted with aftercare program personnel from five U.S. residential treatment centers for DMST survivors. Interviews were conducted with staff from five different residential treatment centers providing services exclusively to domestic minor sex trafficking survivors. Participants described the range of services offered to address survivors’ post-trafficking needs. Participants’ responses assisted in expanding an existing care model to include education re-entry, family reunification, family reconciliation, and emergency substance use services. This study led to the refinement of an aftercare service delivery model and laid the foundation to develop best practice guidelines for providing aftercare services to DMST survivors. Sex trafficking is a global health problem affecting our youth today. Nurses have a vital role in combating sex trafficking by raising awareness about the problem and restoring the lives of sex trafficking victims by implementing innovative care programs.

Systematic review of facilitators of, barriers to, and recommendations for healthcare services for child survivors of human trafficking globally


Author(s): Karen Albright, Jordan Greenbaum, Sherry A. Edwards, and Carmelle Tsai
Publication year: 2018

Summary: This study reviews the current research literature regarding the quality and ease of access to health care services for child survivors of human trafficking. The study finds significant barriers exist in the health care system and the quality of care for trafficked children is inadequate to meet the needs of trafficked children. The study’s principal recommendation is collaborative partnerships (a multi-disciplinary team) among professional and medical service providers to facilitate quality standards of care and access to survivor services to meet the specific needs of trafficked children.

Abstract: “Background: Child trafficking is associated with multiple physical and mental health problems, yet relatively little is known about the factors that facilitate or hamper delivery of high-quality health care services to trafficked children. Objective: To summarize information about identified facilitators of, barriers to, and recommendations for medical and mental health service provision to trafficked children. Participants and setting: A systematic review was conducted of the English-language, peer-reviewed literature on medical and mental healthcare of trafficked children published since 2010. Methods: Inclusion criteria were: (1) the study population or focus included, wholly or in part, individuals under the age of 18 years; (2) the study focus was clearly defined as human trafficking or commercial sexual exploitation; (3) a main focus included health services or barriers to care, and (4) the article contained original data.
**Recover, continued**

**Results:** Of the 29 articles meeting inclusion criteria, 19 included facilitators of health service provision to trafficked populations, 22 included barriers to that provision, and 25 included explicit recommendations for service improvement. 45 distinct facilitators were identified a total of 140 times, 118 distinct barriers were identified a total of 174 times, and 52 distinct recommendations were identified a total of 100 times. The majority of facilitators, barriers, and recommendations fell under the locus of the healthcare provider and healthcare organization.

**Conclusions:** Existing research reveals abundant areas of opportunity for healthcare professionals and healthcare administrators to improve access to, and quality of, medical and mental health care for trafficked children.

**Evidence-Based Human Trafficking Policy: Opportunities to Invest in Trauma-Informed Strategies**


Author(s): Taylor J. Scott, Alexandra M. Ingram, Shannon L. Nemer, and Daniel Max Crowley

Publication year: 2019

**Summary:** This study evaluates the impact of trauma-informed research and best practices has on human trafficking federal legislation and policy. The study finds legislators and policymakers need evidence-based research and actionable recommendations in trauma-informed best practices so that future policies provide interventions necessary to meet the recovery needs of trafficking survivors.

**Abstract:** “Human trafficking is a critical social issue characterized by chronic trauma among victims, and frequently preceded by traumatic experiences that contribute to risk of victimization. Therefore, the research-based practice of trauma-informed care is a highly appropriate lens for both prevention and intervention. This work examines federal legislation in the United States related to human trafficking for references to trauma, as well as how the use of research could implicitly direct public policy responses toward trauma-informed approaches. Legislation on human trafficking has risen substantially since 1989, and the use of research and trauma language within these policies has also observed substantial increases. While the use of trauma language was associated with limited progression in the policy process, legislation using research language was more likely to pass out of Committee and become enacted. Moreover, legislation may leverage research in ways that have the potential to bolster trauma-informed practice among human trafficking victims. Specifically, research can be used to describe the problem and causal mechanisms (e.g., impact of trauma), guide “best practice” for service delivery, and generate knowledge through studies and evaluations that guide future policy. Therefore, human trafficking legislation that implicitly guides trauma-informed practice via the use of research may be particularly promising for the field.
Support Healing


Author: Abigail M. Judge
Publication year: 2018

Summary: The complexity of recovery from sex trafficking requires a holistic and comprehensive approach. The exit and recovery patterns for victims of trafficking must be seen in the whole of the patient’s experiences including the context of their childhood. Victimization produces physical, psychological, emotional, and relational challenges. Addressing the whole person using a systems approach not isolated psychological interventions proves beneficial to recovery. This article is very readable and uses vignettes to demonstrate the application of best practices.

Abstract: In recent years, heightened attention has been paid to commercial sexual exploitation, including domestic human sex trafficking (HST), with mental health concerns named the most dominant health concern among survivors. Human sex trafficking is associated with significant and long-term mental health consequences. Research to date has emphasized ways to identify survivors in health care settings. Once identified, however, few specialized services are available to help survivors exit and recover. The current services infrastructure for HST has been compared to the disjointed social response to intimate partner violence before the women’s movement helped develop a system of battered women’s shelters. Although research has highlighted the need for a multidisciplinary and interagency response to HST, including mental health care, best practices have not yet been formulated. Furthermore, available services are fragmented across sectors. With psychology and psychiatry taking tentative steps to develop services for HST survivors, this article identifies six principles to help avoid a fragmented and potentially re-traumatizing clinical and systemic response. The overarching goal is to design services that are flexible, accessible, trauma informed, survivor driven, responsive to stages of change, multidisciplinary, and enduring, especially given the centrality of healthy attachments and community in trauma recovery. Principles are derived from the limited available research on HST services and from examples of efficacious interventions for patient groups with similar characteristics. The discussion is also informed by composite clinical vignettes from a specialized clinic for adult survivors of HST, housed in a major teaching hospital. Finally, practice recommendations and strategies for building interdisciplinary collaborations are discussed.

Lifelong wellbeing for survivors of sex trafficking: collaborative perspectives from survivors, researchers, and service providers
Support Healing, continued, and Bring Justice

Author(s): Vatne Bintliff, Amy; Stark, Christine; DiPrete Brown, Lori; and Alonso, Araceli
Publication year: 2018

Summary: “This article summarizes a collaborative effort by researchers, service providers, and women who have experienced exploitation and trafficking for sex, to inform policy and practice related to care for survivors.” Note: This includes women from the United States as well as other countries. (Source: Women’s United Nations Report Network - WUNRN).

Abstract: This article summarizes a collaborative effort by researchers, service providers, and women who have experienced exploitation and trafficking for sex, to inform policy and practice related to care for survivors. The effort brought together current research program experience from around the world, and survivor perspectives, in a 2015 interactive forum entitled “STREETS of Hope: Listening to and Supporting Survivors of Human Trafficking.” A participatory approach to defining wellbeing, designed especially for use with vulnerable or highly marginalized populations of women and girls, provided the framework for the discussions. In addition, attempts were made to use principles of trauma-informed care during the workshop itself, toward the overall goals of 1) working as equals to inform research agendas; 2) gaining insights from survivors to improve services; and 3) providing survivors and all participants with a wellbeing model that can help them think and speak with specificity and clarity about their personal growth, wellbeing, and self-care. The results of the interactive two-day workshop and subsequent consultations included: 1) increased understandings and more detailed descriptions of what wellbeing is from the lived experience of survivors, and 2) insights about ways that services and care can be more responsive to the needs and preferences of survivors. Further, the collective exercise suggested revisions and specifications to the wellbeing model itself. Finally, the collaborators identified future directions for their shared research and practice. Overall, the experience of the “STREETS of Hope Forum” supports the idea that iterative, equitable, collaborative work with survivors must be employed to inform systems of care, and that a dynamic and multi-dimensional concept of wellbeing can help survivors, researchers, program leaders and policy-makers to foster support and agency throughout the life course. For those who participated, “STREETS of Hope” constituted a reframing of the goals of services care. It enabled us to think beyond basic needs and survival as defined by caregivers, to one that centers the experience of survivors and fosters recognition of and realization of their talents and life aspirations.”

The voices of survivors: An exploration of the contributing factors that assisted with exiting from commercial sexual exploitation in childhood

Author(s): Annie Corbett
Publication year: 2018

Summary: “Survivors should be more fully utilized as a source of knowledge to improve and inform exit-strategies for those seeking to leave the sex trade industry.”

Abstract: “According to the Federal Bureau of Investigation (FBI), cases of Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Children (CSEC) have increased considerably in the United States over the past few years, with over 1.1 million reported cases (ECPATUSA, 2017), particularly in the Northern California San Francisco Bay Area. From a strengths-based trauma-informed perspective, this study explored the factors that assist youth with exiting the life associated with CSEC. The primary research question was, “What can be learned from the lived experiences of women who successfully exited childhood commercial sexual exploitation and perceive themselves to be functioning well despite this history? This qualitative...
study employed semi-structured interviews with 13 predominately women of color, average age of 25 (range 21–26), who successfully exited the Life after enduring an average of 4 years (range 1–9). The average age for the group for becoming exploited was 13 (range 8–17), with all exiting during their 17th year. A thematic analysis identified 20 themes organized under three primary categories. The first category, Self-Defined Wellness (4): naming of self-outside the Life, positive family connections, breaking the cycle, and embracing the term survivor. The second, Describing the Life (6): sex for goods, surviving the Game, pimp control, wanting to be loved/look good, contributing family factors, and the grooming process. The third, Exiting Process (10): naming one who has exited, others depend on me, not profitable to exit, fear keeps you in, thinking about leaving, the role of family, pending motherhood, wanting to be free, sustaining exit, and professional systems not accessed. There were four recommendations from survivors: active listening, encouragement, non-judgment, and don't leave when we push. Two anecdotal themes emerged: treated like garbage by the legal system, and I thought I was grown.

The study design uniquely positioned the voices of survivors as experts in relation to expanding knowledge about the exiting process and in offering recommendations for youth-at-risk, family members, and providers. Contributions include underscoring the importance of bearing witness to youths' stories as part of resiliency/recovery and valuing the complexities of family relationships/dynamics in the exiting process. Implications for advocacy, research, and practice are discussed.

A Qualitative Study of Women’s Experiences Transitioning from the Sex Trade to Legal Employment Opportunities


Author(s): Shannon Knight Deer

Publication year: 2017

Summary: This study of women transitioning out of the sex trade and into legal employment describes the challenges, supports and types of learning used throughout their transition. The findings are organized into a model that shows the sociocultural influences on this transition process and the connections between exiting the industry and beginning a new life outside of the sex trade.

Abstract: Law enforcement, the media, and the public have given recent attention to the sex trade in conjunction with an increased focus on combatting sex trafficking. However, little is known about women’s experiences transitioning out of the sex trade, especially related to learning and finding economically sustainable employment. The purpose of this study was to investigate the experiences of women transitioning out of the sex trade, especially related to finding legal employment. Transitional learning theory, experiential learning theory, and a general transition model formed the conceptual framework which guided this study. Participants included 10 adult English speaking women who engaged in the sex trade in Texas for at least 1 year, and who exited the sex trade at least 3 months before being interviewed. Data collection involved two semi-structured interviews composed of open-ended questions and probing questions. I used the constant comparative coding method for data analysis. Respondents described the challenges, supports, and types of learnings used throughout their experience transitioning from the sex trade. The participants’ experiences were categorized into (a) employment related challenges, (b) managing mental health and emotions, (c) navigating basic life skills, and (d) building, rebuilding, and managing relationships. Themes related to women’s supports include (a) how women found support, (b) the importance of support providers conducting a needs assessment with women, (c) the supportive relationships women experienced, (d) the necessity of holistic support, and (e) the support women felt was missing while they transitioned. Finally, themes related to women’s types of learning included (a) experiential learning, (b) social learning, (c) the role of survivor leaders in power and policy,
Support Healing, continued, and Bring Justice

and (d) the need to treat survivor leaders as experts and teachers. I organized the findings into a model to describe women’s transition process. The findings have implications for practice—by organizations, employers, and law enforcement—as well as policy and future research.

Caring for Human Trafficking Victims: A Description and Rationale for the Medical Safe Haven Model in Family Medicine Residency Clinics


Author(s): Ronald Chambers

Publication year: 2019

Summary: Medical Safe Haven Programs provide long-term care for human trafficking (HT) patients using validated victim-centered trauma-informed care and incorporating survivor-informed practices. They coordinate care with local community agencies, provide training for healthcare provider, and ensure comprehensive care by mitigating barriers to access, reducing risk of re-traumatization, and preventing failure of victim rehabilitation. These programs have improved the lives of many HT victims, but more work is needed to ensure effective, accessible, long-term care.

Abstract: Human trafficking is a growing public health issue. As we understand more about the prevalence of persons experiencing trafficking accessing clinical services and their unique healthcare needs, we recognize the need for programs dedicated to creating a safe environment to ensure victims and survivors have equitable, sustainable access to the physical, mental, and psychosocial care they require. Healthcare providers are often a first line of care for persons experiencing trafficking and represent a significant opportunity to positively impact outcomes in terms of health, overall quality of life, and reintegration into society. Here we discuss how persons experiencing trafficking present in the clinic, including survivors’ reported experiences with healthcare providers, how to identify victims, and why it is important to do so appropriately in a trauma-informed manner. We then describe key characteristics of a “Medical Safe Haven” clinic, an umbrella term used to describe clinics providing longitudinal care for patients who have been trafficked using validated victim-centered trauma-informed care techniques and incorporating survivor-informed practices. Medical Safe Haven clinics coordinate care with local community agencies, provide training for healthcare providers, and ensure longitudinal, comprehensive care by mitigating barriers to access, reducing risk of re-traumatization, and preventing failure of victim rehabilitation. We conclude with recommendations for next steps in evaluation and dissemination of this model of care.

Optimizing Placement of Residential Shelters for Human Trafficking Survivors


Author(s): Kayse Lee Maass, Andrew C. Trapp, Renata Konrad

Publication year: 2019
Support Healing, continued, and Bring Justice

Summary: This study proposes an optimization model that allocates a budget for locating residential shelters for human trafficking (HT) victims in a manner that maximizes a measure of societal impact (labor productivity gained, reduction in juvenile arrests, disability-adjusted life years averted, and legislative environment) while also taking into account the demand for shelters, the current number of shelters available, and construction and operating costs.

Abstract: Residential shelters play a critical role in the stabilization and eventual reintegration to society for trafficked persons and entail a large investment. In the United States, survivors of human trafficking live in every state. However, in 2018 a majority of states lack dedicated residential shelters for trafficking survivors. Even in states with shelters, data suggests that demand greatly exceeds capacity, and significant disparity exists between states with respect to the legislative environment and provision of auxiliary services for survivors. We present an optimization approach to evaluate the societal impact of locating dedicated shelters for trafficking survivors at a regional level. Using concepts from health and social welfare economics, we develop an optimization model that allocates a budget for locating residential shelters in a manner that maximizes a measure of societal impact while respecting budgetary constraints. For our case study, we measure this impact via a societal value quantified by a combination of labor productivity gained, reduction in juvenile arrests, disability-adjusted life years averted, and legislative environment, adjusted for the demand for shelters and the current number of shelters available, less construction and operating costs. We illustrate the utility of the model via our case study that allocates a budget among a candidate set of residential shelters for female sex trafficking survivors in the United States. Via sensitivity analyses on a robust set of uncertain parameters, we present policy implications of shelter placements to support this critical societal concern.


Author(s): Julie Anne Laser-Maira, Donna Peach, Charles E. Hounmenou
Publication year: 2019

Summary: In order for survivors of child sexual exploitation to feel valued and to achieve self-actualization, they need trauma-informed services. This study proposes merging Maslow’s hierarchy of needs with a trauma-informed approach to provide a comprehensive framework to assess the service requirements necessary to meet the needs of victims.

Abstract: There is increasing evidence that children who are subject to commercial child sexual exploitation (CCSE) are likely to experience complex mental health needs. Failure to address the trauma experienced by victims of CCSE can lead to suicide attempts, self-harm, and long-term mental health needs (Powell, Asbill, Louis, & Stoklosa, 2018). A ‘trauma-informed’ approach (TIA) creates a responsive environment that improves the motivation of victims of CCSE to seek treatment and service providers to address unmet needs. Merging Maslow’s (1943) hierarchy of needs with a TIA approach provides a comprehensive framework to assess the service requirements necessary to meet CCSE survivors’ needs. Particularly, when Maslow’s hierarchy of needs model is coupled with contemporary extensions, which address our greater understanding of the neurological impact of abuse on physiological
well-being greater resilience can be created. Additionally, a TIA instigates a shift from victims of CCSE being viewed as damaged, to an understanding of the impact abusive experiences have had on their development. That approach permits them and others to perceive their “survivorhood” and develop their capacity to achieve self-actualization. This paper critically examines what is constituted as best practice in trauma-informed mental health service delivery to not only meet needs but to support CCSE survivors’ attainment of self-actualization.

Nightmares and flashbacks: The impact of commercial sexual exploitation of children among female adolescents placed in residential care.


Author(s): Nadine Lanctôt, Joan A. Reid, Catherine Laurier

Publication year: 2019

Summary: This study found that commercially sexually exploited female victims had higher levels of general post-traumatic symptoms, anxious arousal, intrusive experiences, defensive avoidance, and dissociation than non-CSEC girls in residential treatment.

Abstract: Important unresolved questions remain concerning the specific vulnerabilities and intervention needs of female adolescents who experience commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC), when compared to other highly vulnerable female adolescents. This study aimed to assess differences in the level of post-traumatic symptoms reported by those who experienced CSEC during adolescence and those who did not. The study used longitudinal data collected from 125 French-speaking female adolescents who were placed in residential centers between the ages 12 and 17 years. Post-traumatic symptoms were assessed at Time 1 and Time 6, while CSEC involvement was assessed at Times 1-5. One-way ANOVAs were performed to inspect differences in the level of post-traumatic symptoms at Time 6 between the participants who reported CSEC during adolescence (n=70; 56.0%) and those with no history of CSEC (n=55; 44.0%). Hierarchical regressions examined the effects of CESC while controlling for age, immigration status, child sexual abuse, and post-traumatic symptoms reported at Time 1. CSEC during adolescence predicted higher levels of general post-traumatic symptoms, anxious arousal, intrusive experiences, defensive avoidance, and dissociation. CSEC experiences intensify the existing vulnerabilities to traumatic sequelae that characterize female adolescents who are placed in residential care.

The State of the Science Trauma Inquiry


Author(s): Annie Lewis-O’ Connor, Abi Warren, Jeannie V Lee, Nomi Levy-Carrick, Samara Grossman, Mardi Chadwick, Hanni Stoklosa, and Eve Rittenberg

Publication year: 2019
Support Healing, continued, and Bring Justice

Summary: This study illustrates the important role health care providers play in identifying past traumatic life experiences in order to minimize re-traumatizing survivors and facilitate their recovery through trauma-informed practices. The study recommends providers incorporate trauma screening, risk and safety assessments, and connect survivors with relevant service agencies that provide holistic care and long-term support.

Abstract: “Within the context of longitudinal medical care for adults, health care providers have a unique opportunity to inquire and respond to the traumatic life experiences affecting the health of their patients, as well as a responsibility to minimize re-traumatizing these patients during medical encounters. While there is literature on screening women for intimate partner violence, and there is emerging data on pediatric screening for adverse life experiences, there is sparse literature on inquiry of broader trauma histories in adult medical settings. This lack of research on trauma inquiry results in an absence of guidelines for best practices, in turn making it challenging for policy makers, health care providers, and researchers to mitigate the adverse health outcomes caused by traumatic experiences and to provide equitable care to populations that experience a disproportionate burden of trauma. This state of the science summarizes current inquiry practices for patients who have experienced trauma, violence, and abuse. It places trauma inquiry within an anchoring framework of trauma-informed care principles, and emphasizes a focus on resilience. It then proposes best practices for trauma inquiry, which include tiered screening starting with broad trauma inquiry, proceeding to risk and safety assessment as indicated, and ending with connection to interventions.”

Evaluation of Services for Domestic Minor Victims of Human Trafficking


Author(s): Deborah Gibbs, Jennifer L. Hardison Walters, Alexandra Lutnick, Shari Miller, and Marianne Kluckman
Publication year: 2014

Summary: This study describes challenges and evaluates services offered by specific DOJ-funded programs. They assessed the youth served, their service needs, services delivered, the experiences of youth and staff, and the programs’ efforts to strengthen the community’s response to trafficked youth. They recommend a high level of collaboration and care coordination with specific protocols for partnering agencies.

Abstract: “RTI International conducted a participatory process evaluation of three programs funded by the U.S. Department of Justice (DOJ) Office for Victims of Crime (OVC) to identify and provide services to victims of sex and labor trafficking who are U.S citizens and lawful permanent residents (LPR) under the age of 18. The evaluation was funded by the National...
Support Healing, continued, and Bring Justice

Institute of Justice (NIJ), also part of DOJ. The goals of the evaluation were to document program implementation in the three programs, identify promising practices for service delivery programs, and inform delivery of current and future efforts by to serve this population. Specifically, the evaluation described young people served by the programs, their service needs, services delivered by the programs, the experiences of young people and staff with the programs, and programs’ efforts to strengthen community response to trafficked youth.”

Policing Human Trafficking: Cultural Blinders and Organizational Barriers

Author(s): Amy Farrell and Rebecca Pfeffer
Publication year: 2014

Summary: “Current (as of 2014) law enforcement cultural perceptions of human trafficking are hindering officers from being able to correctly identify and respond to trafficking cases.”

Abstract: All fifty states have criminalized human trafficking. However, despite large prevalence estimates of human trafficking victims nationwide, relatively few cases of trafficking have been identified, investigated, and prosecuted at the local level. The researchers, through case records and qualitative interviews, found that cultural perceptions about human trafficking both within the police agencies and the society at large hinder officers from being more proactive in identifying and investigating human trafficking cases. At this time the general understanding of trafficking is too narrow and prevents law enforcement from recognizing trafficking in its various forms. Law enforcement is also hesitant to expand resources in areas that the public may not support or believe is worthwhile. The public’s perception of “worth” is also hindered by a too narrow definition of human trafficking. Furthermore, law enforcement is reactive in human trafficking cases, waiting until there is an outcry from a victim or someone who reports suspicious behavior. In order to potentially increase identification and responses to human trafficking situations, both the public and law enforcement must better understand a broader definition of the term “trafficking” and share a desire to combat it in all its forms. Changes in cultural perceptions will also help encourage more proactive law enforcement efforts in regards to trafficking and its victims.

Gendered Outcomes in Prostitution Arrests in Houston, Texas
**Summary:** “Research indicates that sentencing in the criminal justice system may be impacted by gender. According to a sample taking from 1977-2010 in the Houston area, women were more likely to be arrested and receive a jail sentence for prostitution than men.

**Abstract:** Research is continuing to suggest that gender plays a large role in hindering the criminal justice system from treating individuals equally before the law. Taking data from Harris County in Texas between the years 1977-2010, the researchers provide statistical evidence that women are more than 2x more likely to be arrested for prostitution related offenses than men. However, men are more likely to receive a fine or probation. Through this evidence and supporting literature, law enforcement is shown to focus much more heavily on the suppliers of commercial sex (“sellers”) than on those who purchase or solicit the sexual activities (“buyers”). According to data, men are more likely to be buyers than sellers, which provides additional insight into why women are more often incarcerated. The researchers recommend that “enforcement strategies be adjusted to focus more on male participants of prostitution exchanges, particularly among buyers of sex.”

**Police perceptions of human trafficking**

**Summary:** “Previously-held perceptions by police officers regarding human trafficking and prostitution have hindered law enforcement in its ability to identify and prosecute human trafficking cases correctly. Comparing human trafficking to prostitution cases, which officers are typically more familiar with, can ‘both facilitate and impede human trafficking enforcement’.”

**Abstract:** This research sets out to understand how police perceptions about human trafficking influence investigation and response strategies and techniques among law enforcement. 90 law enforcement officials from 12 US counties were extensively interviewed in order to provide data for this project. Through the interviews, researchers concluded that many law enforcement officials struggle to make distinctions between prostitution and human trafficking. Schema theory, or the idea that human beings create “tools for organizing knowledge gained from prior experience,” is applied to better understand law enforcement officers’ reactions, perceptions, and understanding of human trafficking. The majority of officers have extensive experience with prostitution as a crime through both investigation and actual enforcement practices. Therefore, officers oftentimes relied on understandings and techniques associated with the enforcement of prostitution laws when approaching human trafficking. While comparison allowed officers to more fully grasp and embrace human trafficking as a crime to be actively targeted and investigated, it also may negatively impact the ability of officers to create innovative and new ways to approach investigating and responding to trafficking cases. Officers may simply return to old routines they associate with prostitution, rather than respond in a way that is most appropriate for a trafficking case. It may also limit the kinds of information and evidence officers seek to collect or may cause an officer to struggle to view the individual as a “victim” rather than as a “suspect”. If it is not possible to dedicate the necessary time, resources, or education to help officers learn how to appropriately handle human trafficking cases specifically, officers will most likely rely on previously established schema as they attempt to respond to situations. As previously noted, this can provide both temporary, “short-term benefits and long-term dangers” for the enforcement of human trafficking laws at the local level.
Perceptions of Justice

Author(s): Urban Institute, Justice Policy Center
Publication year: 2018

Summary: “This brief provides the first glimpse into human trafficking survivors’ experiences with the criminal justice system and perspectives on justice. Although the field needs further research that centers survivors’ voices, our findings offer a step in that direction and point to the need to reform current criminal justice system responses to trafficking cases and develop noncriminal justice alternatives for remedying harm.”

Abstract: “Survivors of human trafficking face many challenges when interacting with the criminal justice system, including misconceptions regarding the nature of their victimization, stigma due to perceived involvement in illegal behavior, and xenophobia. Despite these documented challenges, little is known about how survivors perceive the justice system or how they would like to achieve justice with regard to their traffickers. This brief fills that gap by asking 80 survivors of human trafficking how they define justice on their own terms. Less than a quarter of respondents endorsed traditional criminal justice remedies, such as incarceration. Instead, most felt justice could be better achieved through prevention.”

Context-specific language modeling for human trafficking detection from online advertisements


Author(s): Saeideh Shahrokh Esfahani, Maziyar Baran Pouyan, Elena Eneva, Michael J. Cafarella, Gregory J. DeAngelo, Andrew E. Fano
Publication year: 2019

Summary: This paper recommends an approach using natural language processing to identify trafficking ads on websites.

Abstract: Human trafficking is a worldwide crisis. Traffickers exploit their victims by anonymously offering sexual services through online advertisements. These ads often contain clues that law enforcement can use to separate out potential trafficking cases from volunteer sex advertisements. The problem is that the sheer volume of ads is too overwhelming for manual processing. Ideally, a centralized semi-automated tool can be used to assist law enforcement agencies with this task. Here, we present an approach using natural language processing to identify trafficking ads on these websites. We propose a classifier by integrating multiple text feature sets, including the publicly available pre-trained textual language model Bi-directional Encoder Representation from transformers (BERT). In this paper, we demonstrate that a classifier using this composite feature set has significantly better performance compared to any single feature set alone.

Failing Victims? Challenges of the Police Response to Human Trafficking

Author(s): Amy Farrell, Meredith Dank, Ieke de Vries, Matthew Kafafian, Andrea Hughes, Sarah Lockwood

Publication year: 2019

Summary: This study of three U.S. communities found that human trafficking victims often do not trust the police and rarely seek assistance. To improve police response, the study recommends efforts to build trust, promote victim safety, and meet the needs of victims outside of the justice system.

Abstract: The police have a duty to provide assistance to crime victims. Despite the importance of this role, scholars examining police effectiveness have historically been less attentive to the needs of victims. As the police are increasingly called on to combat sex and labor trafficking crimes, it is timely to explore how this new population of victims is served by the police. Information from a review of human trafficking investigations and in-depth interviews with police and service providers in three U.S. communities indicates that human trafficking victims often do not trust the police and rarely seek their assistance. When the police do respond, human trafficking victims seek affirmation of their experiences and safety from future harm.

Assessing the Impact of State Human Trafficking Legislation on Criminal Justice System Outcomes

Authors(s): Farrell, Amy, Vanessa Bouché and Dana Wolfe

Publication year: 2019

Summary: This study analyzes impact of state-level human trafficking initiatives and legislation. The analysis confirms states that invest in anti-human trafficking initiatives and have comprehensive anti-human trafficking legislation have higher arrest rates, improved prosecutorial practices leading to more convictions, and provide better standards of care for victims.

Abstract: “Since 2003, state legislatures in the United States have been active in passing legislation aimed at combating human trafficking. To date, all states have passed laws that criminalize acts of human trafficking, though with significant variation in the penalty structure and associated legal provisions. This article examines what aspects of state human trafficking laws are most impactful at increasing the arrest and prosecution of human trafficking suspects. Using panel data on state laws and associated enforcement actions from 2003 to 2012, this study confirms that more comprehensive state laws that invest in anti-trafficking resources are most strongly associated with human trafficking arrests and prosecutions. States that make legislative provisions for victim assistance, law enforcement training, statutory task forces, and mandatory reporting have higher anti-trafficking criminal enforcement. The political environment in which state human trafficking laws are enacted also influences their enforcement.”
Identifying Effective Counter-Trafficking Programs and Practices in the U.S.: Legislative, Legal, and Public Opinion Strategies that Work

Author(s): Bouche, Vanessa, Amy Farrell, Dana Wittmer
Publication year: 2016

Summary: This study examines the history of counter-trafficking initiatives in the United States. The study identifies the most effective strategies employed at the state-level that produced the best outcomes for law enforcement agencies, future legislation and policy, and public support.

Abstract: “After more than a decade of sustained efforts to combat human trafficking in the United States, it is necessary to step back and examine the effectiveness of key anti-trafficking strategies. Utilizing a multi-method approach, we examine 1) the effectiveness of state-level human trafficking legislation to determine what specific legislative provisions are most effective for obtaining desired outcomes, 2) the characteristics of state prosecutions for human trafficking offenses to determine how state laws are being used to hold offenders accountable, and 3) what the public knows about human trafficking, why the public holds the beliefs that they do, and what the public expects from government anti-trafficking efforts. Together the three parts of the study inform efforts to develop effective counter-trafficking programs and practices for legislators, law enforcement, the courts, anti-trafficking agencies, and the public.”

Assessing the Impact of State Human Trafficking Legislation on Criminal Justice System Outcomes

Authors(s): Farrell, Amy, Vanessa Bouché and Dana Wolfe
Publication year: 2019

Summary: This study analyzes impact of state-level human trafficking initiatives and legislation. The analysis confirms states that invest in anti-human trafficking initiatives and have comprehensive anti-human trafficking legislation have higher arrest rates, improved prosecutorial practices leading to more convictions, and provide better standards of care for victims.

Abstract: “Since 2003, state legislatures in the United States have been active in passing legislation aimed at combating human trafficking. To date, all states have passed laws that criminalize acts of human trafficking, though with significant variation in the penalty structure and associated legal provisions. This article examines what aspects of state human trafficking laws are most impactful at increasing the arrest and prosecution of human trafficking suspects. Using panel data on state laws and associated enforcement actions from 2003 to 2012, this study confirms that more comprehensive state laws that invest in anti-trafficking resources are most strongly associated with human trafficking arrests and prosecutions. States that make legislative provisions for victim assistance, law enforcement training, statutory task forces, and mandatory reporting have higher anti-trafficking criminal enforcement. The political environment in which state human trafficking laws are enacted also influences their enforcement.


**Identifying Effective Counter-Trafficking Programs and Practices in the U.S.: Legislative, Legal, and Public Opinion Strategies that Work**

Author(s): Bouche, Vanessa, Amy Farrell, Dana Wittmer  
Publication year: 2016

**Summary:** This study examines the history of counter-trafficking initiatives in the United States. The study identifies the most effective strategies employed at the state-level that produced the best outcomes for law enforcement agencies, future legislation and policy, and public support.

**Abstract:** “After more than a decade of sustained efforts to combat human trafficking in the United States, it is necessary to step back and examine the effectiveness of key anti-trafficking strategies. Utilizing a multi-method approach, we examine 1) the effectiveness of state-level human trafficking legislation to determine what specific legislative provisions are most effective for obtaining desired outcomes, 2) the characteristics of state prosecutions for human trafficking offenses to determine how state laws are being used to hold offenders accountable, and 3) what the public knows about human trafficking, why the public holds the beliefs that they do, and what the public expects from government anti-trafficking efforts. Together the three parts of the study inform efforts to develop effective counter-trafficking programs and practices for legislators, law enforcement, the courts, anti-trafficking agencies, and the public.”

**Miscellaneous Resources**

**Commercial Sexual Exploitation and Sex Trafficking of Children and Adolescents: A Narrative Review**

Author(s): Elizabeth Barnert, Zarah Iqbal, Janine Bruce, Arash Anoshiravani, Gauri Kolhatkar, Jordan Greenbaum  
Publication year: 2017

**Summary:** “Although research into the prevention, identification, and response to commercially sexually exploited and sex trafficked children is increasing, there is still a large gap in the literature and further research and study is imperative.”

**Abstract:** The researchers delve into the literature available on the topic of commercially sexually exploited and sex trafficked children. They identify that such children have a myriad of “clinical risk factors and high rates of unmet physical and mental health needs” associated with their exploitation. Due to the various medical concerns, current literature highly recommends a trauma-informed approach, in order to provide services to the victims in a way that will not re-traumatize them. While research in this
area is expanding, there are still significant gaps. Medical professionals, particularly those in the field of pediatrics, should be trained to both identify and respond to CSE and sex trafficked youth. It is in this particular area that the research is both most needed and most lacking.